

Fix the Court has compiled a handful of recent examples in which federal judges (non-SCOTUS) have violated the canons of judicial ethics.

This list, from 2020 to the present, is not comprehensive, but it shows that in addition to there being a need for a Supreme Court code of conduct (cf., <u>this list</u> of the justices' ethical lapses), the lower courts' Code of Conduct for U.S. Judges might need an update, and some judges might need a refresher.

- 1. In Jan. 2020, Fifth Circuit Judge Kyle Duncan deliberately misgendered the respondent, a transgender woman, more than two dozen times in his opinion in *U.S. v. Varner*. ¹
- 2. In Mar. 2020, then-W.D. Ky. Judge Justin Walker at his investiture ceremony disparaged the Chief Justice of the United States, talked about his appearances on Fox News and in so many words (e.g., "We will not surrender") spoke as if he were separating himself from half the country and half people whose litigation he'd soon be ruling on.²
- 3. In June 2020, D.C. Circuit Senior Judge Laurence Silberman sent an email to every judge in his court and all D.C. District judges, plus other courthouse staff, in which he criticized a Senate proposal to rename U.S. military bases named after Confederate officers as "madness" and downplayed slavery being a cause of the Civil War.³
- 4. In Nov. 2020, Third Circuit Judge Thomas Hardiman and several of his colleagues lobbied their members of the House of Representatives to vote against the Open Courts Act, a bill that would have overhauled the branch's outdated case management and electronic filings system. Judges are permitted to lobby but only to the extent that "it would generally be perceived that [their] judicial experience provides special expertise in the area, 4" and managing a billion court records is not within any of the judges' expertise.
- 5. In Dec. 2020, Senior Southern District of Iowa Judge Robert Pratt insulted then-President Trump and those he had recently pardoned in an Associated Press interview, saying, "It's not surprising that a criminal like Trump pardons other criminals. [...A]pparently to get a pardon, one has to be either a Republican, a convicted child murderer or a turkey."⁵
- 6. In April 2021, Judge Silberman in his opinion in *Tah v. Global Witness Publishing* went far beyond the facts of the case to rail against the purported media "bias against the Republican Party," calling the *New York Times* and *Washington Post* "Democratic Party broadsheets" and adding that "Silicon Valley [...] similarly filters news delivery in ways favorable to the Democratic Party." ⁶
- 7. In May 2021, a panel of Fifth Circuit judges removed S.D. Texas Judge Lynn Hughes from a case, *U.S. v. Khan*, due to what the panel called a "fixed and inflexible view of the case" after making several antigovernment remarks, including calling Justice Department lawyers "blue-suited thugs" and "retarded" and expressing, per the panel, that government attorneys, are "lazy, useless, unintelligent, or arrogant."⁷

¹ U.S. v. Varner, 948 F.3d 250 (2020).

² See Judge Walker's speech at this link.

³ See "A judge's all-courthouse email sparks debate over removal of Confederate symbols," Washington Post, June 16, 2020 (link).

⁴ See Code of Conduct for United States Judges, Canon 4(A)(2) (link).

⁵ See "Federal judge in Iowa ridicules Trump's pardons," Associated Press, Dec. 29, 2020 (link).

⁶ Tah v. Global Witness Publishing, Inc., 991 F.3d 231 (2021).

⁷ U.S. v. Khan, 997 F.3d 242 (2021).

- 8. In Aug. 2021, Ninth Circuit Judge Lawrence VanDyke in his opinion in *Ford v. Peery* compared his colleagues to career criminals, who would feel no "shame" if they had to confront what he called their "rap sheet," i.e., a series of opinions VanDyke described as "habeas dysfunction." ⁸
- 9. In Aug. 2021, W.D.N.Y. Judge John Sinatra failed to recuse in *Meadors v. Erie County Board of Elections*, a case where supporters of Buffalo Mayor Byron Brown were attempting to add Brown's name to the mayoral race ballot, though Brown lost his primary and missed a filing deadline. Judge Sinatra's brother Nick is a Buffalo real estate developer who has donated to Brown's campaign multiple times, and Brown appears three times in a PR video for Nick's firm. Plus, Judge Sinatra's old law firm, Hodgson Russ, was at one point lead counsel for the City of Buffalo.⁹
- 10. In Sept. 2021, Ninth Circuit Senior Judge Carlos Bea accepted an award at an event hosted by the Claremont Institute and failed insurrectionist John Eastman. 10
- 11. In Sept. 2021, when confronted about breaking the federal recusal statute by *Wall Street Journal* reporters investigating judges' participation in cases in which they had a financial interest in a party, several judges downplayed the significance of their lawbreaking and their responsibility to have complied with the law. Examples include: E.D. Tex. Judge Rodney Gilstrap pleading ignorance as to what was required by the recusal statute, claiming he had declined to disqualify himself in some cases because he believed they'd require little or no action on his part and in others because he didn't think his wife's holdings fell under the ambit of the law; C.D. Calif. Judge R. Gary Klausner saying he had delegated conflict-screening to his staff; and Senior E.D.N.Y. Judge Leo Glasser and D. Nebraska Judge John Gerrard faulting the judiciary's own financial reporting requirements, claiming that by only requiring the disclosure of stock ownership annually, they did not have motivation to keep themselves informed of their holdings year-round. ¹¹
- 12. In Jan. 2022, Judge VanDyke wrote a bizarre separate concurrence to his own majority opinion in order to mock his fellow Ninth Circuit judges' jurisprudence on gun cases and demean their integrity. ¹² (Several other judges have written strange self-concurrences since. ¹³)
- 13. In Jan. 2022, amid the Omicron surge, Fifth Circuit Judge Jerry Smith demanded that an attorney remove his mask during oral argument even though the attorney was plainly audible and made his preference to remain masked clear. ¹⁴
- 14. In Jan. 2022, writing that "The Good Ship Fifth Circuit is on fire," Judge Smith in a case involving United Airlines' vaccine mandate for employees lambasted his two colleagues who held the majority in a 2-1 decision, calling it "incoherent reasoning" and "an orgy of jurisprudential violence," which, had he written it himself, would cause him to "hide [his] head in a bag." ¹⁵

⁸ Ford v. Peery, 9 F.4th 1086, 1097 (2021).

⁹ Meadors v. Erie County Board of Elections (W.D.N.Y, 21-982). The Sinatra & Company Real Estate video is at this <u>link</u>.

¹⁰ See "Ninth Circuit Judge Carlos Bea Despicably Agrees to Be Honored by John Eastman's Claremont Institute, at Event with Orwellian Panel on 'Election Integrity'", Election Law Blog, Sept. 1, 2021 (link).

¹¹ See "Federal Judges With Financial Conflicts," Wall Street Journal, Sept. 28, 2021 (link).

¹² McDougall v. County of Ventura, 20-56220 (5th Cir., Jan. 20, 2022).

¹³ See "Showing Off or Making a Point? Spate of Self-Concurrences Catch Eye of Legal Community," *National Law Journal*, July 21, 2022 (<u>link</u>).

¹⁴ See "5th Circuit judge accused of forcing DOJ attorney to remove mask," Reuters, Feb. 3, 2022 (link).

¹⁵ Sambrano v. United Airlines, 21-11159 (5th Cir., Feb. 17, 2022).

- 15. In Feb. 2022, Fifth Circuit Judge James Ho gave a speech defending Georgetown University Law Center's Ilya Shapiro for tweeting that President Biden's pledge to nominate a Black woman to the Supreme Court would result in a "lesser" nominee who will "always have an asterisk attached." ¹⁶
- 16. In Apr. 2022, it was reported that Ninth Circuit Judge Johnnie Rawlinson had conditioned her taking of senior status to the appointment of a specific successor: Nevada State College General Counsel Berna Rhodes-Ford. 17
- 17. In June 2022, it was reported that E.D. Ky. Judge Karen Caldwell had conditioned her taking of senior status to the appointment of a specific successor: former Ky. Solicitor General Chad Meredith. 18
- 18. In July 2022, a Fifth Circuit panel of Chief Judge Priscilla Richman and Judges Kurt Englehardt and James Ho ruled that S.D. Texas Judge Lynn Hughes "abused his discretion in categorically barring [an] AUSA from all future proceedings in his courtroom," which he did in 2019 due to a grudge that he apparently held against the AUSA from a prior case.¹⁹

Of the judges listed above, only Silberman (in the all-court email instance) and Pratt to our knowledge have apologized for their intemperance.

It is also worth mentioning that, in a category of its own, D. Kan. Judge Carlos Murguia announced his resignation²⁰ in Feb. 2020 after a panel of his peers found him culpable of a years-long pattern of sexual harassment.²¹

¹⁶ See "Go ahead and cancel me too.' Judge defends embattled Georgetown Law hire," Reuters, Feb. 16, 2022 (link).

¹⁷ See "9th Circuit judge urges Biden, Nevada senators to pick state AG's wife as successor," Reuters, Apr. 14, 2022 (link).

¹⁸ See "Biden backs anti-abortion Republican for Kentucky judgeship in apparent McConnell deal," Louisville Courier-Journal, June 29, 2022 (link).

¹⁹ U.S. v. Rodriguez, 21-20270 (5th Cir., July 26, 2022) (link).

²⁰ See Judge Murguia's letter to President Trump at this <u>link</u>.

²¹ See the Sept. 30, 2019, order from the Judicial Council of the Tenth Circuit order In Re: Complaint under the Judicial Conduct and Disability Act, 10-18-90022 (<u>link</u>) and the Mar. 3, 2020, order from the Committee on Judicial Conduct and Disability of the Judicial Conference of the United States, C.C.D. No. 19-02 (<u>link</u>).